

5th meeting of the Expert Group on Disaster-related Statistics in Asia and the Pacific
and the Workshop on Disaster Risks in East and North-East Asia

Disproportionate impact of disasters on women and gender-mainstreamed disaster risk management recommendations for South Korea

September 20(Wed), 2017

Eun Ha Chang, Ph. D.

Director

Center for International Development and Cooperation
Korean Women's Development Institute



한국여성정책연구원
Korean Women's Development Institute

Contents

I. Introduction

II. Major Concepts and Theoretical Background

1. Definition and Cycle of Disaster
2. Theoretical Background

III. Research Design

1. Analytical Framework
2. Case Selection

IV. Analysis

1. Case Analysis
2. Discussion of Results

V. Gender in South Korea's Disaster Management System

VI. Conclusion and Implications



I. Introduction

Research Background

- ▶ Continuous increase in mega-disasters globally
- ▶ Significance of physical, psychological, economic, societal and environmental impact of natural disasters
- ▶ Unequal and discriminatory impact of disasters on women and men

Research Question

- ▶ Can post-disaster reconstruction in developing countries can bring about fundamental and structural change towards gender equality?
- ▶ What can be the implication for South Korea's gender-sensitive disaster management policy?



II. Major Concepts and Theoretical Background

II. Major Concepts and Theoretical Discussion

1. Major Concepts

Definition of Disaster

- ▶ A serious disruption of the functioning of a community or a society involving widespread human, material, economic or environmental losses and impacts, which exceeds the ability of the affected community or society to cope using its own resources(UNISDR, 2009:9)
- ▶ A result of the combination of: the exposure to a hazard; the conditions of vulnerability that are present; and insufficient capacity or measures to reduce or cope with the potential negative consequences resources(UNISDR, 2009:9).

Disaster Cycle

- ▶ Prevention/preparation* – Response – Recovery – Reconstruction/Rehabilitation*
(*where an actual change can occur in terms of gender relationship)

II. Major Concepts and Theoretical Discussion

<Table 1 : Key Issues in Gender and Disasters>

Phase	Issues	Examples
Pre-Disaster	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Vulnerability Risk• Perception	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Pregnant/lactating women• Men in Search & Rescue• Willingness to Evacuate
Emergency	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Coping Strategies	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Mobilizing Social Networks• Temporary Migration• Selling Household Goods
Rehabilitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Needs and Priorities• Social Composition• Creation of New Vulnerabilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Agriculture vs. Health• Greater Female Headship• Sexual/Physical Violence• Alcohol Abuse/Aggression
Reconstruction	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• New Gender Roles• Gender Relationships	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Land Tenure Changes• New Domestic Roles• “Women’s” Programs and Male Exclusion

Source: Delaney and Shrader (2000:14)

Major Concepts and Theoretical Discussion

2. Theoretical Background

- ▶ Disaster and Women's Vulnerabilities
 - ▶ Women's vulnerabilities increase not only due to biological/physiological features but also to unequal status in societal, economic, political spheres and also to traditional discrimination (Neumayer & Plümper, 2007).
 - ▶ Women are more impacted by disasters in underdeveloped countries (Fothergill, 1998: 18)
 - ▶ Women's mortality rate is higher than men in developing countries due to women's low status, childrearing responsibilities and discrimination within the society (Fothergill, 1998: 17).
 - ▶ Natural disasters decrease women's lifespan (higher the impact of disaster, shorter women's lives are) (Neumayer & Plümper, 2007).
 - ▶ Vulnerabilities increase in areas of physical safety, economic, reproduction/health.

Major Concepts and Theoretical Discussion

- ▶ Disaster and Women's Capabilities
 - ▶ Disaster as "opportunity" argument (Yonder, Akcar and Gopalan 2005; Gokhale, 2008; Women and Health Care Reform, 2009)
 - ▶ During disaster response, women carries out active disaster response activities such as rescue, road reconstruction, cleaning up debris and food aid (Bradshaw & Linneker, 2003 in Bradshaw, 2004)
 - ▶ During disaster prevention and recovery, women play the role of community manager (Moser 1993:34-36).
 - ▶ Women's efforts however are not well-recognized, even if so, only during the response stage(Bradshaw, 2004).
 - ▶ Despite women's active participation, they are excluded from decision making roles (OECD, 2012: 17).
 - ▶ Change of thinking called for from "vulnerable victims" to "capable citizen" (Oxfam, 2005: 14).
- ▶ Studies on disaster and women currently stays at the qualitative level, lacking quantitative or longitudinal ones (Fothergill, 1998: 17, Neumayer & Plümper, 2007; Bradshaw & Fordham, 2013: 7).

Major Concepts and Theoretical Discussion

- ▶ Studies on social transformation after disaster
 - ▶ Disaster can be an opportunity for social transformation(McSweeney and Coomes, 2011).
 - ▶ Disaster's impact on social transformation is limited, as community shows resistance to change and tends to return to the original structure (continuity argument) (Quarantelli & Dynes, 1977; Tierney, 2007; Henry, 2011).
 - ▶ While transformation is not likely, social changes may occur to the betterment or to the worse(Passerini, 2000)

III. Research Design

▶ Analytical Framework

▶ Practical vs. Strategic Gender *Needs* by Carolina Moser(1993)

Practical Gender Needs(PGNs)	Strategic Gender Needs(SGNs)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs women identify in their socially accepted roles in society Do not challenge, although they arise out of, gender divisions of labour and women's subordinate position in society Response to immediate perceived necessity, identified within a specific context Inadequacies in living conditions such as water provision, health care and employment. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs women identify because of their subordinate position in society Vary according to particular contexts, related to gender divisions of labour, power and control May include such issues as legal rights, domestic violence, equal wages, and women's control over their bodies Meeting SGNs assists women to achieve greater equality and change existing roles, thereby challenging women's subordinate position.

Source: Moser(1993)

▶ Practical vs. Strategic *Approach* by Pan American Health Organization(1997)

Practical Gender Approach(PGA)	Strategic Gender Approach(SGA)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Short term response 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Long term strategy
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs more easily indefinable 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs less immediately identifiable
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Biological requirements and specific health conditions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Targets inequities in power relationships
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide health goods and services 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Focuses on empowerment processes
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Involves women/men as passive subjects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Involves people as active participants
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improves health conditions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improves the position of women
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gender roles and relations remain constant 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improves balance of power relations

Source: Pan American Health Organization (1997:73)

▶ **Cases Selection**

- ▶ Disaster study methodology
 - ▶ in case of sudden onset, post-disaster observation or individual interviews; in case of slow-onset, study on prevention measures possible
- ▶ Due to difficulties of visiting various disaster sites, this study is based on secondary sources of case compilations
- ▶ Two volumes of case compilations and four articles on disaster cases which focuses on opportunities for change after disaster were analyzed
- ▶ Limited the cases to post 1990, sudden on-set natural disaster such as earthquakes, flood, tsunami, hurricane, volcanic eruption
- ▶ Included countries from diverse continents
- ▶ Included both external-led and internal-led recovery cases

<Table 3 List of Cases >

Case No.*	Country	Province	Disaster (scale)	Year	Title of Case Studies
(Case Compilation) Women's participation in disaster relief and recovery (Yonder, Akcar & Gopalan, 2005)					
1	India	Maharashtra	Earthquake (6.3)	1993	Centering Women's Participation in Reconstruction Efforts in India: The SSP Experience in Maharashtra
2	Turkey	Marmara	Earthquake (7.8)	1998	Creating Spaces for Women in Relief, Recovery, and Reconstruction Efforts in Turkey: The Foundation for the Support of Women's Work (KEDV)
3	India	Gujarat	Earthquake (8.0)	2000	Transferring Skills and Experience: Marathwadi Women's Groups Support EarthquakeStruck Gujarati Women in Taking Action
(Article) Gender, disaster and empowerment: a case study from Pakistan (Farzana Bari, 1998)					
4	Pakistan		Flooded	1992	Gender, disaster and empowerment: a case study from Pakistan. (Farzana Bari, 1998)
(Case Compilation) Six village profiles: women's journey from the tsunami to the future (Swayam Shikshan Prayog.(2005)					
5	Sri Lanka	Unawatuna	Tsunami	2004	Community Members Link with Tourists to Support Those Most in Need
6	India	Indira Nagar	Tsunami	2004	Women's Group Lead an Innovative Recovery Strategy
7		Pudhukuppam	Tsunami	2004	An Anganwadi Works with NGOs to Strengthen her Childcare Centre
8		Rasapettai	Tsunami	2004	Women's Groups Demand Government Rehabilitation Support
9		Samiyarpettai,	Tsunami	2004	Accessing Safe Shelter and Changing Women's Social Roles
10		Sothikuppam	Tsunami	2004	Village Leaders Insist that NGOs Meet Community Needs
(Case Compilation)					
11	Japan		Earthquake (7.2)	1995	Women in the great Hanshin Earthquake (Masai, Kuzunishi and Kondo 2009)
12	Montserrat		Volcanic Eruption	1995	'A We Run Tings': Women Rebuilding Montserrat (Soares and Mullings 2009)
13	Nicaragua, Honduras, El Salvador		Hurricane Mitch	1998	Socio-economic impacts of natural disasters: a gender analysis (Bradshaw, 2004)

* Cases 1,4,5-10 and 13 were analyzed in-depth in this study.

IV. Analysis

1. Case Analysis

- ▶ **1) Case ① Maharashtra Earthquake in 1993 : PGNs and SGNs both satisfied**
 - ▶ PGNs : Women's needs were reflected in housing construction, women's needs were conveyed to local governments through women self-help organizations, launch of girl's education program, construction of washing space are examples of PGN approaches.
 - ▶ SGNs:
 - ▶ Women were trained on and actually carried out construction and spacing design which are traditionally considered as men's duties. (Moser, 1993:51-52). Gender differentiation was destroyed.
 - ▶ Women managed cash and construction materials – control over resources– which broke the traditional gender division, and provided an opportunity for change.

- ▶ **2) Case ④ Flood in Pakistan (1992) : PGNs and SGNs both satisfied**
 - ▶ Local NGO named Pattan conducting highly gender sensitive projects
 - ▶ PGNs
 - ▶ Women were charged with food distribution jobs
 - ▶ SGNs
 - ▶ Income generated from food distribution jobs
 - ▶ Co-ownership of land tenure
 - ▶ Women as headship of family in ration list (Moser, 1993:37-54)
 - ▶ Importance of external aid that is gender sensitive

- ▶ **3) Case ⑤ - ⑩ Six Village Profile - women's journey from the tsunami to the future: PGNs and SGNs somewhat satisfied**
 - ▶ PGNs : satisfied by women's self-help organizations' activities
 - ▶ SGNs: women economically empowered through loan projects However, no incidents of women's organizations getting empowered as to lead decision making
 - ▶ Limits in analysis with no significant change indicated ; continuity of change also cannot be assured.

- ▶ **4) Case ⑬ Hurricane Mitch in Nicaragua, Honduras, El Salvador (Bradshaw, 2004) : SGNs satisfied but limited changes in gender equality**
 - ▶ SGNs: Women's economic self-reliance enhanced through construction, poultry, and agricultural projects which led to breaking of gender stereotypes
 - ▶ More fundamental changes were limited due to male dominated culture and social order
 - ▶ Women provided with seeds but could not sow
 - ▶ Conflict with husband deepened, domestic violence increased
 - ▶ Satisfaction of SGNs do not automatically lead to a fundamental change in gender equality

2. Discussion of Results

- ▶ Observation through Case Analysis
 - ▶ Women's self-help group being the medium and driving force for change by providing PGNs and SGNs in almost all cases analyzed.
 - ▶ After women achieves a certain level of empowerment, marital conflicts were observed.
 - ▶ Post-disaster trauma was identified as serious problem but few psychological intervention took place.
 - ▶ PGNs and SGNs were satisfied through aid recovery projects. However, changes were observed at a community level, but those in more macro and policy level could not be identified.

2. Discussion of Results

▶ Factors for Change in Post Disaster Reconstruction

▶ **Endogenous Factors**


- ▶ As examined in the “continuity” argument (in social transformation through disaster), pre-disaster societal structure act as an endogenous factor that determines the success of disaster response and reconstruction
- ▶ Attention should be paid to individual differences and micro interpretation of how victims perceive disaster (Cupples, 2007). In other words, community level action is important in bringing about change, however, subjectivity of how one views oneself in disaster situation plays an important role as well.

▶ **Exogenous Factors**

- ▶ Existence of external humanitarian assistance with gender sensitivity can act as a key exogenous factor triggering a change.
- ▶ In the case of external intervention, one needs to remember that programs focused on SGNs may fail to bring about fundamental change as women participate in these programs based on very practical ends, believing that these programs benefit her family rather than empowering herself.

3. Limitation of Study

- ▶ Community level changes were identified in almost all cases. However, in order to analyze if such change ends up in more long-term and structural changes, this study shows limitation. For such analysis, longitudinal studies, more cases and pre and post disaster statistics that are sex disaggregated will be required.



V. Gender in South Korea's Disaster Management System

Gender in South Korea's Disaster Management Policy

1. Background

- ▶ Increase in the necessity and interest in disaster and safety management in South Korean society
 - ▶ Man-made disasters : Capsizing of Ferry Boat in West Sea (1993), collapse of Sungsoo Bridge (1994), gas explosion in Daegu subway (1995), collapse of Sampoong Department Store(1995), subway fire in Daegu(2003) and Sewol Ferry Incident(2014)
 - ▶ Natural disasters: exposed to seasonal typhoon during August to September every year; flood, landslide, tidal wave



Gender in South Korea's Disaster Management Policy

- ▶ South Korean government well aware of the importance of disaster management
 - ▶ Establishment of Ministry of Public Safety and Security in 2014 – 2017 (Replaced under the Ministry of Interior in July 2017)
 - ▶ Administrative reshuffle and nation-wide promotion on safety guidelines
- ▶ Disaster related research and studies has been conducted in crisis management and public administration fields
 - ▶ However, few researches exists on gender-sensitive disaster management (KWDI 2014)
 - ▶ More studies under the framework of “women’s safety”

2. Current Status of Gender Mainstreaming in South Korea's Disaster Management Law and Policy

- ▶ Related Laws on Disaster
 - ▶ Basic Law on Disaster and Safety Management(재난 및 안전관리 기본법)
 - ▶ “Law on Disaster and Safety Management seeks to protect territory from various disasters, establish national and local government's disaster and safety system in order to protect lives and assets of citizens, and regulates measures on disaster prevention, response, recovery, and safety promotion” (Article 1).
 - ▶ Law on Disaster Aid Delivery (재해구호법)
 - ▶ “This law seeks to protect disaster victims and contributes to the stabilization of their livelihood by regulating aid to disaster victims and collection and usage of aid materials”(Article 1).

Gender in South Korea's Disaster Management Policy

- ▶ Analysis on Basic Law on Disaster and Safety Management from a Gender Perspective(KWDI 2014)
 - ▶ Lack of concept on “disaster vulnerable people” such as pregnant women, women with children, the aged and disabled and children
 - ▶ Ministry of Gender Equality and Family excluded from and has no legal basis for inter-ministerial coordination in disaster management
 - ▶ No clause with gender-sensitive perspective
 - ▶ No concern for “disaster vulnerable people” and no gender perspective in disaster prevention and response policies
 - ▶ No clause on gender-disaggregated statistics

South Korea's Disaster Management Policy

- ▶ Analysis on Law on Disaster Aid Delivery from a gender perspective(KWDI 2014)
 - ▶ Lack of incorporation of special needs of disaster victims and protection of their privacy
 - ▶ Lack of gender-sensitive perspective. Gender disaggregated assessment should be carried out in the aid planning stage. Law should reflect this.
 - ▶ Aid packet and delivery should reflect gender-differentiated needs of disaster victims.

3. Recommendations for mainstreaming gender in South Korea's disaster management policy (KWDI 2014)

- ▶ Design and develop gender-sensitive and gender disaggregated check list on judgement on risk and vulnerabilities, on disaster coping capabilities and disaster response capabilities
- ▶ Differentiate and identify disaster impact by gender. Disaster aid and recovery should be based on this information.
- ▶ Produce sex disaggregated statistics
- ▶ Publish white papers on disasters with gender perspectives
- ▶ Include women in disaster management planning and evaluation committees
- ▶ Gender sensitive policies are needed in emergency aid, temporary housing, livelihood aid, psychological monitoring

- ▶ Gender Impact Assessment on South Korea's Disaster Management Policy (2015)- major recommendations
 - ▶ Strengthen legal status for vulnerable people
 - ▶ Build capacity for disaster risk management
 - ▶ Consider gender specific approach in response and recovery
 - ▶ Increase women's participation in decision making related with disaster
 - ▶ Disaggregate statistics by gender
 - ▶ Provide disaster response manuals to vulnerable groups

Gender in South Korea's Disaster Management Policy

4. Implications from the Current Study on SK's Disaster Management Policy

- ▶ Difficulties of direct application of this study to South Korea's situation
 - ▶ South Korea not prone to natural disasters except for seasonal typhoon
 - ▶ This study focuses on developing countries where government's' disaster coping capacities are low. As a result reconstruction projects are mainly done by community or international actors. However, even though insufficiently functioning, South Korean disaster management system is in place and plays a significant role.
 - ▶ As gender equality policies are either lacking or insufficient in developing countries studied in this research, disaster reconstruction can be a good opportunity for transformation towards gender equal society. However, South Korea has many laws and policies for gender equality, and there exists many opportunities other than disaster reconstruction where gender equality can be realized.

Conclusion and Implications

- ▶ Still, some implications can be drawn
 - ▶ Importance of acknowledging women's vulnerabilities
 - ▶ This is the cornerstone for satisfying PGNs
 - ▶ But not implemented at the moment through SK's disaster management policies
 - ▶ Importance of acknowledging women's capabilities
 - ▶ This is the beginning of more fundamental change for gender equality
 - ▶ In the past and currently, women in SK has been crucial actor in disaster reconstruction especially in delivering aid.
 - ▶ However, women's needs in temporary housing and PTSD intervention are not met
 - ▶ Women are excluded from decision making in recovery stage

Thank You



한국여성정책연구원
Korean Women's Development Institute